

APPENDIX 4

Peer-Review Guide and Instructor Scoring Rubric

Report By: _____ Author: Did the reviewers do a good job? 1 2 3 4 5
ID Number Rate the overall quality of the peer review

Reviewed By: _____
ID Number ID Number ID Number ID Number

Section 1: Introduction and Guiding Question	Reviewer Rating			Instructor Score
1. Did the author provide enough background information?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
2. Is the background information accurate?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
3. Did the author describe the goal of the study?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
4. Did the author make the guiding question explicit and explain how the guiding question is related to the background information?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
Reviewers: If your group made any “No” or “Partially” marks in this section, please explain how the author could improve this part of his or her report.	Author: What revisions did you make in your report? Is there anything you decided to keep the same even though the reviewers suggested otherwise? Be sure to explain why.			
Section 2: Method	Reviewer Rating			Instructor Score
1. Did the author describe the procedure he/she used to gather data and then explain why he/she used this procedure?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
2. Did the author explain what data were collected (or used) during the investigation and why they were collected (or used)?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
3. Did the author describe how he/she analyzed the data and explain why the analysis helped him/her answer the guiding question?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2

APPENDIX 4

Section 2: Method <i>(continued)</i>	Reviewer Rating			Instructor Score
4. Did the author use the correct term to describe his/her investigation (e.g., experiment, observations, interpretation of a data set)?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
Reviewers: If your group made any “No” or “Partially” marks in this section, please explain how the author could improve this part of his or her report.	Author: What revisions did you make in your report? Is there anything you decided to keep the same even though the reviewers suggested otherwise? Be sure to explain why.			

Section 3: The Argument	Reviewer Rating			Instructor Score
1. Did the author provide a claim that answers the guiding question?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
2. Did the author include high-quality evidence in his/her argument?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
Were the data collected in an appropriate manner?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
Is the analysis of the data appropriate and free from errors?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
Is the author’s interpretation of the analysis valid?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
3. Did the author present the evidence in an appropriate manner by	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
• using a correctly formatted and labeled graph (or table);	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
• including correct metric units (e.g., m/s, g, ml); and	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
• referencing the graph or table in the body of the text?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
4. Is the claim consistent with the evidence?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
5. Did the author include a justification of the evidence that explains why the evidence is important (why it matters) and defends the inclusion of the evidence with a specific science concept or by discussing his/her underlying assumptions?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
6. Is the justification of the evidence acceptable?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
7. Did the author discuss how well his/her claim agrees with the claims made by other groups and explain any disagreements?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
8. Did the author use scientific terms correctly (e.g., hypothesis vs. prediction, data vs. evidence) and reference the evidence in an appropriate manner (e.g., supports or suggests vs. proves) correctly?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2

Section 3: The Argument (continued)				
<p>Reviewers: If your group made any “No” or “Partially” marks in this section, please explain how the author could improve this part of his or her report.</p>	<p>Author: What revisions did you make in your report? Is there anything you decided to keep the same even though the reviewers suggested otherwise? Be sure to explain why.</p>			
Mechanics	Reviewer Rating			Instructor Score
1. Organization: Is each section easy to follow? Do paragraphs include multiple sentences? Do paragraphs begin with a topic sentence?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
2. Grammar: Are the sentences complete? Is there proper subject-verb agreement in each sentence? Are there run-on sentences?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
3. Conventions: Did the author use appropriate spelling, punctuation, paragraphing, and capitalization?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
4. Word Choice: Did the author use the appropriate word (e.g., there vs. their, to vs. too, than vs. then)?	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Partially	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	0 1 2
Instructor Comments:				

Total: _____/50